

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN
Department of History
Spring 2006

History 982

Florencia E. Mallon

Transition to Capitalism and Nation-State Formation in
Nineteenth-Century Latin America

Description:

Considered before to be one of the "backwaters" of historical research, where traditional political and military history reigned supreme, the nineteenth century has been emerging as one of the periods in Latin American history with the greatest potential for theoretical and methodological innovation. For the past two decades, an unusually large and creative amount of work has appeared. It has been inspired in the debates around world systems and dependency theory, articulation of modes of production and the transition to capitalism, and more recently on ethnicity, gender, and nation-state formation, and the "new" economic and cultural histories. Much of this literature has also been informed by the desire to illuminate the faces of the common folk, reclaiming their experiences as they confronted the integration of their societies and economies into the modern world capitalist system.

Yet as the contributions of this new literature have taken shape, so have its weaknesses. Authors who attempted to apply frameworks broadly informed by Marxist class analysis were unable fully to explain gender, ethnic, and political/ideological/cultural dimensions. The pioneers of "history from below" have sometimes gone to extremes in their granting of agency to the oppressed, while those who questioned the uncritical celebration of popular resistance tended to move into the complete dismissal of popular agency in history. Most recently, dialogue with cultural studies and postmodern or poststructural approaches has produced a subfield of "new cultural history" sometimes too caught up in its own jargon and assumptions.

With these problems has also come a crisis in theory; some historians now hesitate to reach broader conclusions, while others strongly attack the use of cultural or social theory in history. Where is the field going? Has the dramatic shift in 19th century history from a bulwark of traditionalism to an arena of cultural contestation and innovation simply caused rifts too deep to repair? Through discussion of common and supplementary readings and written critical reviews, we will discuss some initial answers to these complex questions.

Requirements

1) **Active participation in class.** The core of our work in the course will be reading and discussion of abundant materials. Taking the time and energy to contribute to class discussion, whether with a comment, question, doubt, or criticism, is a crucial

component of this. Active participation does not always mean speaking a lot, but it does mean listening to and engaging other people's ideas and comments, and being willing to risk asking a "stupid" question in order to move the discussion forward. The seminar's success depends on it!

2) Three short review essays (7-10 pp.), each taking a weekly topic from one of the three units as a starting point to explore in more depth the issues emerging from those readings. In addition to addressing more fully the implications of the assigned readings themselves, you will choose, in consultation with me, some additional materials, approximately one extra book and one article. A supplementary bibliography handed out at the beginning of class will provide a good starting point for your search.

a) The students responsible for the review in each week will also collaborate in the preparation of a study guide of discussion questions in consultation with me. This study guide will be posted on our class list by the Tuesday afternoon preceding class.

b) The review essays will be due no later than two weeks after the discussion of the topic on which they are based, with the obvious exception of the last two weeks of class and two weeks before Thanksgiving; you must all choose one of your topics from each of the three units. Please hand in two copies, so that, with your permission, I can keep one on file as a resource for students who are preparing for prelims.

5) Grading: Class participation: 40%
Review Essays: 20% each

SCHEDULE OF CLASS MEETINGS AND READINGS:

Week 1- Jan. 20- Introduction

Background Reading: Florencia E. Mallon, "Editor's Introduction," Latin America's Nineteenth Century History, Special Issue of Latin American Perspectives, XIII: 1 (Winter 1986), pp. 3-13.

As a general resource, the Cambridge History of Latin America, ed. Leslie Bethell, Vols. III-V, covers different aspects of the nineteenth century and provides some additional bibliography. If used advisedly (some authors wrote new, synthetic essays while others served up "rewarmed" old materials), it can be quite useful.

ALSO: 1) In the Hispanic American Historical Review, 65:4 (November 1985), historiographical essays by Eric Van Young, John J. Johnson, and David Bushnell

list and variously analyze the existing historical literature for Mexico/Central America, Latin America, and South America (respectively).

2) William Taylor, "Between Global Process and Local Knowledge: An Inquiry into Early Latin American Social History, 1500-1900," in Reliving the Past: The Worlds of Social History, ed. Olivier Zunz (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press), pp. 115-90, gives a good overview of the nineteenth century.

3) Steve J. Stern, "Between Tragedy and Promise: The Politics of Writing Latin American History in the Late Twentieth Century," in Gilbert M. Joseph (ed.), Reclaiming the Political in Latin American History: Essays from the North (Durham: Duke University Press, 2001), pp. 32-77, places some of the recent debates in historical and political context.

PLEASE NOTE: Read in the above advisedly. It is not meant as an exhaustive list, but only as a set of readings that can begin to familiarize you with the issues in the field. If you are already familiar with these or other similar readings, all the better.

AVAILABILITY OF READINGS: The books assigned are available ONLY at Rainbow Bookstore Cooperative, 426 W. Gilman, 257-6050, and on 3-hour reserve at the College Library in Helen C. White Hall; they are designated with an * on the syllabus. The articles are part of a Xerox Packet available at the Humanities Copy Center, 1650 Humanities, and on 3-hour reserve in Helen C. White Hall; they are designated with an #.

UNIT I- COLONIAL CRISIS AND THE PROMISES OF INDEPENDENCE, 1780-1870

Week 2- Jan. 27- The Colonial Crisis: Promises and Realities

Reading: *Sarah C. Chambers, From Subjects to Citizens: Honor, Gender and Politics in Arequipa, Peru, 1780-1854 (University Park: Penn State Press, 1999).

#Steve J. Stern, "The Age of Andean Insurrection, 1742-1782: A Reappraisal," in Resistance, Rebellion and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant World, 18th to 20th Centuries, ed. Steve J. Stern (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 34-93.

#Sinclair Thomson, "'We Alone Will Rule...': Recovering the Range of Anticolonial Projects Among Andean Peasants (La Paz, 1740s to 1781)," Colonial Latin American Review, Vol. 8, No. 2, 1999, pp. 275-99.

#Carolyn E. Fick, "The French Revolution in Saint Domingue: A Triumph or a Failure?", in David Barry Gaspar and David Patrick Geggus (eds.), A Turbulent Time: The French Revolution and the Greater Caribbean (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1997), pp. 51-77.

Week 3- Feb. 3- Mexico: Possibilities from Below

Reading: *Peter F. Guardino, Peasants, Politics, and the Formation of Mexico's National State: Guerrero, 1800-1857 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996).

#John Tutino, "The Revolution in Mexican Independence: Insurgency and the Renegotiation of Property, Production, and Patriarchy in the Bajío, 1800-1855," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78: 3 (August 1998), pp. 367-418.

#Michael T. Ducey, "Village, Nation, and Constitution: Insurgent Politics in Papantla, Veracruz, 1810-1821," Hispanic American Historical Review, 79:3 (August 1999), pp. 463-493.

#Peter F. Guardino, "The Reconstruction of Order in the Countryside," in The Time of Liberty: Popular Political Culture in Oaxaca, 1750-1850 (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005), pp. 223-74.

Week 4- Feb. 10- Andean Republicanisms (I)

Reading: *Brooke Larson, Trials of Nation Making: Liberalism, Race, and Ethnicity in the Andes (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

Week 5- Feb. 17-Andean Republicanisms (II)

Reading::*Mark Thurner, From Two Republics to One Divided: Contradictions of Postcolonial Nationmaking in Andean Peru (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997).

Week 6- Feb. 24-Andean Republicanisms (III)

Reading: * James E. Sanders, Contentious Republicans : Popular Politics, Race, and Class in Nineteenth-Century Colombia (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004).

UNIT II- STRUGGLES OVER CITIZENSHIP, 1850-1910

Week 7- Mar. 3- A Step to the Side: The State of Latin American Economic History

Reading: #Paul Gootenberg, "Between a Rock and a Softer Place: Reflections on Some Recent Economic History of Latin America," Latin American Research

Review, Vol. 39, No. 2, June 2004, pp. 239-57.

#John H. Coatsworth, "Economic and Institutional Trajectories in Nineteenth-Century Latin America," in Coatsworth and Alan M. Taylor, Latin America and the World Economy Since 1800 (Cambridge, MA: David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies, 1998), pp. 23-54.

#Gail D. Triner, "Recent Latin American Economic History and Its Historiography," Latin American Research Review, Vol. 38, No. 1, February 2003, pp. 219-37.

#Steven C. Topik and Allen Wells, "Introduction: Latin America's Response to International Markets during the Export Boom," in Topik and Wells (eds.), The Second Conquest of Latin America: Coffee, Henequen, and Oil during the Export Boom, 1850-1930 (Austin: University of Texas Press, Institute of Latin American Studies, 1998), pp. 1-36.

Week 8- Mar. 10- Alternative Citizenships in the Caribbean

Reading: *Ada Ferrer, Insurgent Cuba: Race, Nation, and Revolution, 1868-1898 (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1999).

#Francisco A. Scarano, "Liberal Pacts and Hierarchies of Rule: Approaching the Imperial Transition in Cuba and Puerto Rico," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78:4 (November 1998), pp. 583-601.

#Astrid Cubano-Iguina, "Political Culture and Male Mass-Party Formation in Late-Nineteenth-Century Puerto Rico," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78:4 (November 1998), pp. 631-62.

*****SPRING BREAK, 11-19 MARCH*****

Week 9- Mar. 24- The Public Sphere and Citizenship

Reading: *Hilda Sabato, The Many and the Few: Political Participation in Republican Buenos Aires (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001).

#Florencia E. Mallon, "Decoding the Parchments of the Latin American Nation-State: Peru, Mexico and Chile in Comparative Perspective," in Dunkerley (ed.), Studies in the Formation, pp. 13-53.

Week 10- Mar. 31- Alternative Citizenship in Mexico and the Andes

Reading: * Florencia E. Mallon, Peasant and Nation: The Making of Postcolonial

Mexico and Peru (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).

#Hilda Sabato, "On Political Citizenship in Nineteenth-Century Latin America," American Historical Review, 106:4 (October 2001), pp. 1290-1315.

UNIT III- LIMITING CITIZENSHIP: RACE, GENDER AND THE NATION, 1880-1930

Week 11- Apr. 7- Citizenship and Abolition

Reading: * Rebecca Scott, Slave Emancipation in Cuba: The Transition to Free Labor, 1860-1899, 2nd. Ed. (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2000).

#Barbara Weinstein, "The Decline of the Progressive Planter and the Rise of Subaltern Agency: Shifting Narratives of Slave Emancipation in Brazil," in Joseph (ed.), Reclaiming the Political, pp. 81-101.

#Rebecca Scott, "Race, Labor and Citizenship in Cuba: A View from the Sugar District of Cienfuegos, 1886-1909," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78:4 (November 1998), pp. 687-728.

Week 12- Apr. 14- Guatemala: Indigenous Nationalisms, Violence, and Servitude

Reading: *Greg Grandin, The Blood of Guatemala: A History of Race and Nation (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000).

#David McCreery, "Debt Servitude in Rural Guatemala, 1876-1936," Hispanic American Historical Review, Vol. 68, No.4, 1983, pp. 735-53.

Week 13- Apr. 21- Race, Gender and Colonialism in the Caribbean

Reading: *Eileen Findlay, Imposing Decency: The Politics of Sexuality and Race in Puerto Rico, 1870-1920 (Durham: Duke University Press, 1999).

#Aviva Chomsky, "'Barbados or Canada?' Race, Immigration, and Nation in Early-Twentieth-Century Cuba," Hispanic American Historical Review, 80:3 (August 2000), pp. 415-62.

Week 14- Apr. 28-Eugenics and Emerging States

Reading: *Nancy Leys Stepan, The Hour of Eugenics: Race, Gender, and Nation in Latin America (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991).

#Nancy Appelbaum, "Whitening the Region: Caucaño Mediation and 'Antioqueño Colonization' in Nineteenth-Century Colombia," Hispanic American Historical Review, 79:4 (November 1999), pp. 631-67.

History 982- Mallon- Spring 2006- page 7

Week 15- May 5- Race and Nation in Latin America

Reading: Nancy P. Appelbaum, Anne S. Macpherson, and Karin Alejandra Roseblatt (eds.), Race and Nation in Modern Latin America (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003).

*******REVIEW ESSAYS FOR WEEKS 14 AND 15 DUE LATEST
ON WEDNESDAY, MAY 10TH, AT 5:00 P.M.*******

LIST OF READINGS IN XEROX PACKET (Listed in the order assigned)

- 1) Steve J. Stern, "The Age of Andean Insurrection, 1742-1782: A Reappraisal," in Resistance, Rebellion and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant World, 18th to 20th Centuries, ed. Steve J. Stern (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 34-93.
- 2) Sinclair Thomson, "'We Alone Will Rule...': Recovering the Range of Anticolonial Projects Among Andean Peasants (La Paz, 1740s to 1781)," Colonial Latin American Review, Vol. 8, No. 2, 1999, pp. 275-99.
- 3) Carolyn E. Fick, "The French Revolution in Saint Domingue: A Triumph or a Failure?," in David Barry Gaspar and David Patrick Geggus (eds.), A Turbulent Time: The French Revolution and the Greater Caribbean (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1997), pp. 51-77.
- 4) John Tutino, "The Revolution in Mexican Independence: Insurgency and the Renegotiation of Property, Production, and Patriarchy in the Bajío, 1800-1855," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78: 3 (August 1998), pp. 367-418.
- 5) Michael T. Ducey, "Village, Nation, and Constitution: Insurgent Politics in Papantla, Veracruz, 1810-1821," Hispanic American Historical Review, 79:3 (August 1999), pp. 463-493.
- 6) Peter F. Guardino, "The Reconstruction of Order in the Countryside," in The Time of Liberty: Popular Political Culture in Oaxaca, 1750-1850 (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005), pp. 223-74.
- 7) Paul Gootenberg, "Between a Rock and a Softer Place: Reflections on Some Recent Economic History of Latin America," Latin American Research Review, Vol. 39, No. 2, June 2004, pp. 239-57.
- 8) John H. Coatsworth, "Economic and Institutional Trajectories in Nineteenth-Century Latin America," in Coatsworth and Alan M. Taylor, Latin American and the World Economy Since 1800, pp. 23-54.
- 9) Gail D. Triner, "Recent Latin American Economic History and Its Historiography," Latin American Research Review, Vol. 38, No. 1, February 2003, pp. 219-37.
- 10) Steven C. Topik and Allen Wells, "Introduction: Latin America's Response to International Markets during the Export Boom," in Topik and Wells (eds.), The Second Conquest of Latin America: Coffee, Henequen, and Oil during the Export Boom, 1850-1930 (Austin: University of Texas Press, Institute of Latin American Studies, 1998), pp.

1-36.

11) Francisco A. Scarano, "Liberal Pacts and Hierarchies of Rule: Approaching the Imperial Transition in Cuba and Puerto Rico," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78:4 (November 1998), pp. 583-601.

12) Astrid Cubano-Iguina, "Political Culture and Male Mass-Party Formation in Late-Nineteenth-Century Puerto Rico," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78:4 (November 1998), pp. 631-62.

13) Florencia E. Mallon, "Decoding the Parchments of the Latin American Nation-State: Peru, Mexico and Chile in Comparative Perspective," in Dunkerley (ed.), Studies in the Formation, pp. 13-53.

14) Hilda Sabato, "On Political Citizenship in Nineteenth-Century Latin America," American Historical Review, 106:4 (October 2001), pp. 1290-1315.

15) Barbara Weinstein, "The Decline of the Progressive Planter and the Rise of Subaltern Agency: Shifting Narratives of Slave Emancipation in Brazil," in Joseph (ed.), Reclaiming the Political, pp. 81-101.

16) Rebecca Scott, "Race, Labor and Citizenship in Cuba: A View from the Sugar District of Cienfuegos, 1886-1909," Hispanic American Historical Review, 78:4 (November 1998), pp. 687-728.

17) David McCreery, "Debt Servitude in Rural Guatemala, 1876-1936," Hispanic American Historical Review, Vol. 68, No.4, 1983, pp. 735-53.

18) Aviva Chomsky, "'Barbados or Canada?' Race, Immigration, and Nation in Early-Twentieth-Century Cuba," Hispanic American Historical Review, 80:3 (August 2000), pp. 415-62.

19) Nancy Appelbaum, "Whitening the Region: Caucaño Mediation and 'Antioqueño Colonization' in Nineteenth-Century Colombia," Hispanic American Historical Review, 79:4 (November 1999), pp. 631-67.