

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-MADISON  
Department of History  
Semester I, 1992-93

COLONIAL TRANSFORMATIONS IN LATIN AMERICA  
(PART I)

History 730

Steve J. Stern  
5105 Humanities  
263-1800/3-1841

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This graduate seminar highlights landmark books, topics, and debates relevant to the social history and political economy of colonial Latin America. Its reading list and assignments provide a sense for the contours of the historiography in these fields, and invite us to share the excitement of recent research.

The instructor begins with four premises:

1. The colonial Latin American experience, while important in its own right, is also an inescapable prerequisite for those seriously interested in the study of post-colonial history. Given the existence of large indigenous populations for whom the "colonial question" remains very much alive, and given the uneven, regionally varied, and often non-linear patterns of change in 19th- and 20th- century Latin America, problems and issues in colonial social history and political economy resonate into the modern era.

2. The distinction between "social history" and "political economy" is a limited one. The actions of social groups, including non-elite people, had an important impact on economic life, and colonial political economy structured social life in crucial ways. From this perspective, therefore, "social history" and "political economy" are not well understood in isolation of one another.

3. Our purpose in seminar is not simply to "cover information," but most especially, to engage debates, explore implications, interpret significances, and sharpen our critical tools as historians. Of course, one cannot do the latter tasks very well without digesting and understanding considerable amounts of empirical information. We also cannot live up to our mandate unless we all approach the seminar as a collective effort requiring everyone's active and sometimes vociferous involvement. This is your seminar.

4. In one semester, it is useless to try to touch on all topics or historiographies relevant to colonial Latin America. In the fields of social history and political economy, our reading list contains glaring omissions. Student papers will undoubtedly compensate for some of these. (Note: We are giving only modest attention to the considerable literature on slavery in part because Prof. Scarano deals considerably with such issues in his courses on the Caribbean, and in part because I occasionally offer a Comparative World History seminar on slavery.) In addition, entire fields are slighted. A Latin American historian should know, for example, the rich tradition in intellectual and cultural history associated with Mario Góngora, Lewis Hanke, John Tate Lanning, Irving Leonard, Richard Morse, Edmundo O'Gorman, J. M. Ots Capdequí,

John L. Phelan, Silvio Zavala, and more recently, David Brading, Beatriz Pastor, and Anthony Pagden. But this field plays a secondary rather than central role in this course. One cannot do everything all at once!

The field of colonial history is the largest and perhaps the most richly developed in Latin American historiography. Its long-standing historiographical tradition requires that students digest older "classics" that shaped research, debate, and the state of knowledge. At the same time, colonial history is a field bursting with innovative new works, findings, and interpretations. The method we will use to strike a balance between current and older works of importance is the following. We will generally focus on recent works in the assigned readings discussed in class, but students will incorporate older "classics" in their papers, and the "roundtable" and "panel" sessions will enable us to discuss older and newer works simultaneously. In addition, the instructor will comment briefly on selected "classics" included in Part II of the syllabus during the discussion of assigned readings.

Once in a while, our readings will include works written by the instructor. On these occasions, we will take special measures, including departure of the instructor from the room for an ample period, to facilitate frank and dynamic discussions.

Part II of this syllabus provides supplementary bibliographical orientation through about 1989. For works between 1989 and 1992, you will need to rely on Part I's list of supplementary readings, and on your own initiative.

Our discussions take place in three formats. The colloquium format refers to focused seminar discussion on works read by the entire class. The roundtable format refers to conversations between and among mini-groups who will have coordinated distinct but related clusters of assigned reading. The panel format refers to critical commentary and discussion based on student papers.

## SCHEDULE

### I. GETTING STARTED.

#### Week 1. Introduction. Sept. 4.

Organizational meeting. No assigned readings. Students unfamiliar with colonial Latin American history are advised to read Charles Gibson, Spain in America (New York, 1966), for background. This little text is also a good way for more experienced students to brush up. Also useful are essays in Leslie Bethel, ed., The Cambridge History of Latin America, vols. 1-3 (New York, 1984-1985). For historiography, see the assessments by Benjamin Keen, "Main Currents in United States Writings on Colonial Spanish America, 1884-1984," Hispanic American Historical Review, 65:4 (Nov., 1985), 657-682; William B. Taylor, "Between Global Process and Local Knowledge: An Inquiry into Early Latin American Social History, 1500-1900," in Olivier Zunz, ed., Reliving the Past: The Worlds of Social History (Chapel Hill, 1985), 115-190.

Discussion: legacies of the colonial past.

Week 2. The Theoretical Challenges of Colonialism: Humanoid Others,  
Colonial Entanglement, Resistant Adaptation. Sept. 11.

Format: colloquium.

Rdng.: Nicholas Thomas, Entangled Objects: Exchange, Material Culture,  
and Colonialism in the Pacific (Cambridge, Ma., 1991).

Gerald Sider, "When Parrots Learn to Talk, and Why They Can't:  
Domination, Deception, and Self-Deception in Indian-White  
Relations," Comparative Studies in Society and History, 29  
(1987), 3-23.

Steve J. Stern, "New Approaches to the Study of Peasant Rebellion  
and Consciousness: Implications of the Andean Experience," in  
Stern, ed., Resistance, Rebellion, and Consciousness in the  
Andean Peasant World, 18th to 20th Centuries (Madison, 1987),  
3-25.

Suppl.: "Tensions of Empire": Thematic issue, American Ethnologist, 16  
(1989), Frederick Cooper and Ann L. Stoler, eds.

## II. CONQUEST STRUGGLES AND THE NEW SOCIAL FOUNDATIONS OF AMERICA.

Week 3. Iberian Convulsions and Extensions:  
The Creation of a Trans-Atlantic World. Sept. 18.

Format: roundtable.

Rdng.:

ALL: J. H. Elliott, "The Spanish Conquest and Settlement of America,"  
in Leslie Bethel, ed., The Cambridge History of Latin America  
(New York, 1984-1985), 1: 149-206, 579-585.

Steve J. Stern, "Paradigms of Conquest: History, Historiography,  
and Politics," Journal of Latin American Studies (forthcoming  
1992).

GRP. A: Homero Aridjis, 1492: The Life and Times of Juan Cabezón of  
Castile, trans. Betty Ferber (New York, 1991).

GRP. B: Bernal Díaz del Castillo, The Conquest of New Spain, trans. J. M.  
Cohen (New York: Penguin ed., 1963). Much of this may be  
skimmed, esp. 7-139.

GRP. C: Ida Altman, Emigrants and Society: Extremadura and Spanish  
America in the Sixteenth Century (Berkeley, 1989).

Suppl.: Alexandra Parma Cook and Noble David Cook, Good Faith and Truthful  
Ignorance: A Case of Transatlantic Bigamy (Durham, 1991).

Week 4. Missionary-Indigenous Encounters. Sept. 25.

Format: colloquium.

NOTE: This is the week of the UW "Discovery" Conference. Therefore, we will make special arrangements for an informal evening meeting on Sept. 25 to discuss both the readings and the conference proceedings. I expect you to attend at least two panels at the conference.

Rdng.: Inga Clendinnen, "Disciplining the Indians: Franciscan Ideology and Missionary Violence in Sixteenth-Century Yucatán," Past and Present, 94 (Feb., 1982), 27-48.

Inga Clendinnen, Ambivalent Conquests: Maya and Spaniard in Yucatan, 1517-1570 (New York, 1987).

Suppl.: Ramón A. Gutiérrez, When Jesus Came, the Corn Mothers Went Away: Marriage, Sexuality, and Power in New Mexico, 1500-1846 (Stanford, 1991).

Sabine MacCormack, Religion in the Andes: Vision and Imagination in Early Colonial Peru (Princeton, 1991).

Louise M. Burkhart, Nahua-Christian Moral Dialogue in Sixteenth-Century Mexico (Tucson, 1989).

Week 5. Indigenous America (I): Responses to Colonial Power. Oct. 2.

Format: colloquium.

Rdng.: Steve J. Stern, Peru's Indian Peoples and the Challenge of Spanish Conquest: Huamanga to 1640 (Madison, 1982).

Stuart B. Schwartz, "Indian Labor and New World Plantations: European Demands and Indian Responses in Northeastern Brazil," American Historical Review, 83:1 (Feb., 1978), 43-79.

Suppl.: Serge Gruzinski, Man-Gods in the Mexican Highlands: Indian Power and Colonial Society, 1500-1800, trans. Eileen Corrigan (Stanford, 1989).

Week 6. Indigenous America (II): Ethnogenesis and Long-Term Survival. Oct. 9.

Format: roundtable.

Rdng.:

GRP. A: Marcello Carmagnani, El regreso de los dioses. El proceso de reconstitución de la identidad étnica en Oaxaca: Siglos xvii y xviii (Mexico City, 1988).

GRP. B: Nancy M. Farriss, Maya Society under Colonial Rule: The Collective Enterprise of Survival (Princeton, 1984).

Suppl.: James Lockhart, forthcoming book on Nahuas in central Mexico.

III. THE STRUCTURES, CONFLICTS, AND ACCOMMODATIONS OF COLONIAL LIFE.

Week 7. The Political Economy of Mines and Mercantile Investment. Oct. 16.

Format: roundtable.

Rdng.:

ALL: D. A. Brading and Harry E. Cross, "Colonial Silver Mining: Mexico and Peru," Hispanic American Historical Review, 52:4 (Nov., 1972), 545-579.

Carlos Sempat Assadourian, "Integración y desintegración regional en el espacio colonial: un enfoque histórico," reprinted in Assadourian, El sistema de la economía colonial: mercado interno, regiones y espacio económico (Lima, 1982), 109-34.

Enrique Tandeter, "La producción como actividad popular: 'ladrones de minas' en Potosí," Nova Americana, 4 (Turin, 1981), 43-65.

Steve J. Stern, "Feudalism, Capitalism, and the World-System in the Perspective of Latin America and the Caribbean," American Historical Review, 93:4 (Oct., 1988), 829-872, and debate between Wallerstein and Stern, 873-897.

GRP. A: Peter Bakewell, Silver and Entrepreneurship in Seventeenth-Century Potosí: The Life and Times of Antonio López de Quiroga (Albuquerque, 1988).

GRP. B: Doris Ladd, The Mexican Nobility at Independence, 1780-1826 (Austin, 1976).

Suppl.: Louisa S. Hoberman, Mexico's Merchant Elite, 1590-1660: Silver, State, and Society (Durham, 1991).

Week 8. Plantation Economies, Extractive Economies: The Case of Brazil. Oct. 23.

Format: colloquium. SEE NOTE AT BOTTOM OF WEEK 8 LISTING.

Rdng: Stuart B. Schwartz, "Colonial Brazil, c. 1580-c. 1750: Plantations and Peripheries," in Bethel, ed., Cambridge History, 2: 423-499, 856-864.

Richard Price, ed., Maroon Societies: Rebel Slave Communities in the Americas (2nd ed., Baltimore, 1979), 170-226 (articles by Kent, Bastide, Schwartz).

Stuart B. Schwartz, "Resistance and Accommodation in Eighteenth-Century Brazil: The Slaves' View of Slavery," Hispanic American Historical Review. 57:1 (Feb., 1977), 69-81.

C. R. Boxer, The Golden Age of Brazil, 1695-1750 (Berkeley, 1969), 30-60, 162-225.

(readings continue on next page)

Week 8 (cont'd)

Donald Ramos, "Slavery in Brazil: A Case Study of Diamantina, Minas Gerais," The Americas, 45:1 (July, 1988), 47-59.

Suppl.: Stuart B. Schwartz, Slaves, Peasants, and Rebels: Reconsidering Brazilian Slavery (Urbana, 1992).

NOTE: Depending on class preferences, we may choose to read the supplementary reading in lieu of the assigned reading (the 1992 book, however, is only available in hardback), or to read Schwartz's big 1985 book (see Part II of syllabus). We will decide this at the start of the semester.

Week 9. Landed Estates in Context: Hacienda versus Peasant Agriculture, Economic Cycles and Profit Mechanisms. Oct. 30.

Format: roundtable.

Rdng.:

ALL: Brooke Larson, "Rural Rhythms of Class Conflict in Eighteenth-Century Cochabamba," Hispanic American Historical Review, 60:3 (Aug., 1980), 407-430.

Arnold J. Bauer, "Rural Workers in Spanish America: Problems of Peonage and Oppression," Hispanic American Historical Review, 59:1 (Feb., 1979), 34-63.

GRP. A: François Chevalier, Land and Society in Colonial Mexico: The Great Hacienda, Alvin Eustis, trans. (Berkeley, 1963).

Charles Gibson, The Aztecs Under Spanish Rule: A History of the Indians of the Valley of Mexico, 1519-1810 (Stanford, 1964), 300-334.

William B. Taylor, "Landed Society in New Spain: A View from the South," Hispanic American Historical Review, 54:3 (Aug., 1974), 387-413.

GRP. B: Brooke Larson, Colonialism and Agrarian Transformation in Bolivia: Cochabamba, 1550-1900 (Princeton, 1988).

Karen Spalding, "Hacienda-Village Relations in Andean Society to 1830," Latin American Perspectives, 2:1 (Spring, 1975), 107-121.

GRP. C: Mario Góngora, Origen de los inquilinos de Chile central (orig. ed. 1960; 2nd ed. Santiago de Chile, 1974).

Week 10. Urban Crucibles: High Society and Plebeian Society. Nov. 6.

Format: roundtable.

Rdng.: see next page.

Week 10 (cont'd).

Rdng.:

ALL: Michael C. Scardaville, "Alcohol Abuse and Tavern Reform in Late Colonial Mexico City," Hispanic American Historical Review, 60:4 (Nov. 1980), 643-71.

Patricia Seed, "Social Dimensions of Race: Mexico City, 1753," ibid., 62:4 (Nov. 1982), 569-606.

GRP. A: Alberto Flores Galindo, Aristocracia y plebe: Lima, 1760-1830 (Lima, 1984).

GRP. B: Juan Pedro Viqueira Albán, ¿Relajados o reprimidos? Diversiones públicas y vida social en la Ciudad de México durante el Siglo de las Luces (Mexico City, 1987).

Suppl.: R. Douglas Cope, forthcoming book on Mexico City (UW 1987 diss.).

Mary C. Karasch, Slave Life in Rio de Janeiro, 1808-1850 (Princeton, 1987).

Week 11. Women, Gender, and Honor in the Structure of Color-Class Power.

Nov. 13.

Format: colloquium.

Rdng.: Verena Martínez-Alier (now V. Stolcke), Marriage, Class and Colour in Nineteenth-Century Cuba: A Study of Racial Attitudes and Sexual Values in a Slave Society (Cambridge, 1974).

Ramón Gutiérrez, "Honor Ideology, Marriage Negotiation, and Class-Gender Domination in New Mexico, 1690-1846," Latin American Perspectives, 44 (Winter, 1985), 81-104.

John Tutino, "Power, Class, and Family: Men and Women in the Mexican Elite, 1750-1810," The Americas, 39:3 (Jan. 1983), 369-81.

Ruth Behar, "Sexual Witchcraft, Colonialism, and Women's Powers: Views from the Mexican Inquisition," in Lavrin, ed., Sexuality [full citation listed below], 178-206.

Suppl.: Asunción Lavrin, ed., Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America (Lincoln, 1989).

IV. THE PROBLEM OF COLONIAL HEGEMONY: CONSTRUCTION AND DISSOLUTION.

Week 12. No meeting: final phase of essay preparation. Nov. 20.

Rdng.: Begin Week 13 listing of background rdngs. on the crisis of colonial hegemony.

Week 13. No meeting: final phase of essay preparation/Thanksgiving. Nov. 27.

Rdng.: see next page for background readings for Wk. 15 panel.

Week 13 (cont'd).

Rdng.: Background readings on the crisis of colonial hegemony/Wk. 15 panel:

ALL: George Reid Andrews, "Spanish American Independence: A Structural Analysis," Latin American Perspectives, 44 (Winter, 1985), 105-132.

GRP. A: John L. Phelan, The People and the King: The Comunero Revolution in Colombia, 1781 (Madison, 1978).

GRP. B: Stern, ed., Resistance, Rebellion, and Consciousness, Parts I, II. [Full citation in Week 1 rdngs.] Feel free to read essays in Parts III & IV if you wish to stretch the temporal perspective.

GRP. C: John Lynch, The Spanish-American Revolutions, 1808-1826 (New York, 1973). Special attention to the studies of Argentina, Venezuela, Peru, and Mexico, and to the opening and concluding chapters. Feel free to read other chapters as well.

Suppl.: D. A. Brading, The First America: The Spanish Monarchy, Creole Patriots, and the Liberal State, 1492-1867 (New York, 1991).

Week 14. The Contentious Constructions of Colonial Hegemony:  
From Conquest to Governance. Dec. 4.

Format: panel (specific topics to be determined).

Rdng.: student papers.

Week 15. The Makings of Colonial Upheaval:  
Divided Elites, Social Unrest, Imperial Renewal. Dec. 11.

Format: panel (specific topics to be determined).

Rdng.: background readings listed under Week 13,  
AND  
student papers.

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS AND GRADING

There are two course assignments: oral participation, and preparation of a review-essay to be discussed in the student panels. The review-essays will incorporate considerable extra readings, including older "classics" not in the assigned readings.

The success of the seminar depends on the quality of our weekly discussions and debates. Please think through the issues, arguments, and implications of the readings, and please contribute your thoughts and insights to the discussion. I hope that we will create an atmosphere that is reasonably relaxed, yet animated and articulate. Oral participation will include not only general week-to-week discussion, but also specific roles in the student panels.

The review-essay (15-25 pages) will analyze a significant problem in the

history of colonial Latin America, and draw out explicitly the implications of supplementary readings and paper topics for our understanding of the assigned core readings and topics in the seminar. The main objective is analysis of a historical problem based on more ample readings. A secondary objective is to present clearly the interpretations, findings, and controversies at the heart of major works omitted from our core readings. In other words, we will digest some of the historiography through collaborative research and reading--a division of labor in a collective venture. Extra readings for these papers will normally amount to the equivalent of 5-8 major works, in addition to the assigned core readings.

For some paper topics, the relationship between historical and historiographical analysis may be very closely intertwined. For others, the tension between the two may be great. To alleviate the potential conflict, and to free authors to focus more on history than historiography, authors should append a brief annotated bibliography in which annotations of 2-3 lines suffice to present the gist of a work on its own terms, thereby freeing you to be more selective and decisive in the ways you draw on works in the text of your papers. When the argument of a work (on its own terms) is clear in the text of your essay, your annotation may simply note: "Discussed in text." Students will vote at the start of the semester about whether to consider annotations a formal requirement or an optional recommendation. If you vote to make this a requirement, failure to provide a satisfactory annotated bibliography will lead to a suffer a half-grade penalty on the paper.

Early in the semester, I will distribute a list of suggested paper topics to provide an idea of the sorts of topics that are both valuable and feasible. The suggestions are meant to assist your thought process, and are not to be considered a restricted list of permitted topics.

For each student panel, papers to be discussed on Friday will be due the preceding Monday at 3:00 p.m. to give ample time to all students to read them thoughtfully. We will probably organize the discussion around the comments of students serving as discussants of the papers.

All papers must be double-spaced, with the printed or typed letters dark and easy to read. We are all intellectuals, and we read tens of thousands of pages each year. Let us be courteous to our eyes. Draft mode dot matrix print-outs are for drafts, not for final copies of papers! I will return faint or fuzzy print unread.

Grading will be weighted roughly as follows: 50% written work, 50% class discussion.