

History 600 (Section 09) “Toleration”
Wednesday 1:20-3:20 5255 Humanities

Professor Sorkin
4711 Humanities djsorkin@wisc.edu
Office hours: T/Th 4pm

This course will explore the meaning of “toleration” in Europe from the post-Reformation period (17th century) to the mid-20th century. “Toleration” is a central issue that has long been neglected, or assumed to have been exhausted, as a field of inquiry. The question of toleration begins in relationship to religious minorities in the Reformation; in this form it continues well into the nineteenth and even early twentieth centuries. In the nineteenth century toleration also metamorphosed into a question of the status and rights of national or ethnic minorities. In the twentieth century it transformed into the issue of human rights. We will trace those developments and explore some of their ramifications.

We will read recent scholarship that takes issue with aspects of the conventional wisdom about toleration. For example, there is an entrenched view that toleration emerged from the idea of individual liberty and equality. We will see that there were multiple origins of the idea of toleration, including distinctly medieval and religious ones, and that toleration was related to such notions as “co-existence” and “concord.” Similarly, historians have long taught that the Enlightenment was the source of ideas of toleration. Recent scholarship has shown not only that multiple practices of toleration long preceded the Enlightenment but also that earlier thinkers had already articulated many of the ideas associated with Enlightenment toleration. Finally, there is a well established triumphalist narrative that deems toleration a Protestant, and especially an Anglo-Dutch invention, while assigning persecution and intolerance to Catholicism. We will see that toleration was created across Europe and by members of all faiths.

We will read in common for six weeks. Readings will be of two sorts. We will read scholarly articles (“secondary works”): these will teach you about the history and nature of toleration yet also provide models for your own work. Each article displays its own approach to history and historical research and writing. The aim is for you to learn the material these articles contain as well as to assess them critically in order to help you think about the kind of scholarly paper you aspire to write. We will read “intensively” rather than “extensively.” With the exception of the first week, the page total each week will be light. You should read these articles carefully and analyze them before coming to class.

For the second and three weeks of common reading (January 26th; February 2nd) you should choose one of the articles and write a **2 PAGE SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS WHICH YOU SHOULD BRING TO CLASS**. First summarize the argument. In a concise and lucid manner say what the author has argued and provide the historical information necessary to understand that argument. Then analyze the argument. What is the shape of the argument? What questions has the author asked? What materials has he/she used? Is the argument convincing? Are there problematic aspects of the argument? Could the author have approached the subject in a different way?

We will also read historical documents (“primary sources”). For the fourth and fifth weeks of common readings (February 9th and 16th) you should choose one primary document and write a **2 PAGE SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS WHICH YOU SHOULD BRING TO CLASS**. What is the document? When was it written? Who wrote it? Where? What does it say? Why is it important? You should then evaluate how a scholar we have read for that week analyzes the document. What kind of analysis does the historian present? What questions does he/she ask? The readings, primary and secondary, are available on Learn@UW.

The aim of this course is for you to write a 20-25 page research paper based on both primary sources and secondary works. You will begin to formulate your research topic during the period of common readings in consultation with the instructor. I will first meet with each of you during the third and fourth weeks of the semester (weeks of January 31st and February 7th) to get to know you and to discuss a possible topic. We will visit Memorial Library in order to be introduced to research methods and materials. You will spend the rest of the semester researching and writing your paper. We will continue to meet as a class in order for you to have a structure in which to work. You will be part of a peer group that will read and comment on your work at all stages. I will also continue to meet with you individually.

Attendance is **required**. Attendance is crucial because the class functions as a unit. You will learn to do research as a group: you will help each other learn to conduct research and to write a scholarly paper. Peer review will be an integral part of the process of research and writing. Please talk to me in advance in case you have to miss a class. *EACH MISSED CLASS WILL LOWER YOUR FINAL GRADE BY HALF A LETTER GRADE.*

Required Books for Purchase at UBS

Benjamin J. Kaplan, Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe (Cambridge, MA: Harvard U. Press, 2007)

John Locke, A Letter Concerning Toleration (Buffalo, Prometheus, 1990) (ISBN 0-87975-598-9)

All other reading is available at Learn@UW

Week 1. January 19th

Benjamin J. Kaplan, Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe (Cambridge, MA: Harvard U. Press, 2007) 1-234, 333-358

*****Bring 3-4 page analysis of Kaplan to class.

Week 2. January 26th Reformation: Early Examples of Toleration, Ideas and Practices

Castellio, Concerning Heretics, 121-35; 136-40; 216-225; 225-253; 265-87

Istvan Bejczy, “Tolerantia: A Medieval Concept,” Journal of the History of Ideas (1997) 365-384

N. M. Sutherland, “Persecution and Toleration in Reformation Europe,” in W.J. Sheils ed., Persecution and Toleration (Blackwell, 1984) 153-161

Hans R. Guggisberg, “The Defense of Religious Toleration and Religious Liberty in Early Modern Europe: Arguments, Pressures and Some Consequences,” History of European Ideas 4 (1983) no. 1, 35-50

*****Bring 2 page analysis of Bejczy or Guggisberg to class.

Week 3. February 2nd Protestant Pluralism: Holland, England and Prussia

Holland

M.E.H.N. Mout, “Limits and Debates: A Comparative View of Dutch Toleration in the Sixteenth and early Seventeenth Centuries,” in C. Berkvens-Stevelinck, J. Israel & G.H. M. Meyjes eds., The Emergence of Tolerance in the Dutch Republic (Leiden: Brill, 1997) 37-47

England

John Locke, A Letter Concerning Toleration (Buffalo, Prometheus, 1990) (ISBN 0-87975-598-9)
Ian Machin, "British Catholics," in Rainer Liedtke & Stephan Wendehorst eds., The Emancipation of Catholics, Jews and Protestants (Manchester, 1999) 11-32
Act of Toleration 1689 (Schaff, 119-25)
Catholic Relief Act 1778 (Maclear, 15-16)
Catholic Emancipation 1829 (Maclear, 126-29)
Repeal of the Corporate and Test Acts 1828 (Maclear, 190-191)
Jewish Emancipation 1858 (Mendes-Flohr/Reinharz, Jew in the Modern World, 151-152)

Prussia

Samuel Pufendorf, Of the Nature and Qualification of Religion in Reference to Civil Society, 104-09
Walter Grossman, "Religious Toleration in Germany, 1648-1750," Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century 201 (1982) 115-141
Peace of Westphalia 1648 (Parry vol 1 198-200, 215-17, 228-230)
Edict of Potsdam 1685 (Schaff 116-118)
Judenreglement 1750 (Mendes-Flohr/Reinharz, 22-27)
1788 Wöllner Decrees (Maclear, 31-4)

*****Bring 2 page analysis of Mout, Machin or Grossman to class.

Week 4. February 9th Catholic Toleration: Poland, France & the Habsburg Empire

Poland

Wiktor Weintraub, "Tolerance and Intolerance in Old Poland," Canadian Slavonic Papers 13 (1971) 1, 21-43

Habsburg empire

Jaroslav Pánek, "The question of tolerance in Bohemia and Moravia in the age of the Reformation," in Ole Peter Grell & Bob Scribner eds., Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation (Cambridge, 1996) 231-48

Edict of Toleration (Protestants) 1781 (Maclear, 26-7)

Edict of Toleration (Jews) 1782 (Mendes-Flohr/Reinharz, 36-40)

France

Marisa Linton, "Citizenship and Religious Toleration in France," in Ole Peter Grell & Roy Porter eds., Toleration in Enlightenment Europe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000) 157-74

Pierre Bayle, Philosophical Commentary on the Words of the Gospel, Luke 14:23, "Compel them to Come in, That My House May be Full" (Indianapolis, Liberty Fund, 2005) 199-219

Edict of Nantes 1598 (Schaff, 88-97)

Revocation of Nantes 1685 (Maclear, 5-7)

Toleration of Protestants 1787 (Maclear, 7-10)

Declaration of Rights of Man and Citizen 1789 (Maclear, 76)

Jewish emancipation 1790-1791 (Hunt, 86-88, 99 & 101)

Concordat 1801 (Maclear, 95-96)

*****Bring 2 page analysis of an historical document to class.

Week 5. February 16th 19th century

André Encrevé, "French Protestants," in Rainer Liedtke & Stephan Wendehorst eds., The Emancipation of Catholics, Jews and Protestants (Manchester, 1999) 56-82

Benjamin Constant, "On religious liberty," in Principles of Politics Applicable to All Representative Governments (Benjamin Constant: Political Writings ed., Biancamari Fontana; Cambridge, 1988) 274-89

C.A. Macartney, National States and National Minorities (London, 1934) ch. 4 "The Age of Nationalism" & ch. 5 "International Minority Protection up to 1914," 92-175

Conference of London (Greece) 1830 (Mahler, Jewish Emancipation, 43)(Holland 33)

Belgian Constitution 1831 (Maclear, 130)

1848 (Mahler, 48-9)

Congress of Berlin 1878 (Holland 301-Roumania, 306-Porte)

*****Bring 2 page analysis of an historical document to class.

Week 6. February 23rd 20th century

Inis L. Claude, National Minorities: An International Problem (Harvard, 1955) ch. 1-3, 6-50

Samuel Moyn, The Last Utopia: Human Rights in History (Harvard, 2010) ch. 2 “Death from Birth,” 44-83

Versailles & Minority Rights (Mahler, 67-71)

UN & Human Rights (Lynn Hunt, Inventing Human Rights, 223-229)

Week 7. March 2nd Individual Meetings to discuss paper topics

Week 8. March 9th. Present Two-page proposal to peer group

Two-page proposal = description of topic, central questions, list of primary sources

March 16th: Spring Vacation

Week 9. March 23rd: Present 2 page outline & analysis of a primary source to peer group

Week 10. March 30th: Present 3-5 pages of paper (from any part of the paper) to peer group

Week 11. April 6th: Present 7-10 pages of paper to peer group

Week 12. April 13th: Present 12-15 pages of paper to peer group

Week 13. April 20th: Present 15-20 pages to peer group

Week 14. April 27th. Present complete paper to peer group

May 5th: Submit finished paper. Meet on Union Terrace to celebrate!

[Sources of Documents:

Maclear = J.F. Maclear, Church and State in the Modern Age: A Documentary History (OUP, 1995)

Schaff = Philip Schaff, The Progress of Religious Freedom as Shown in the History of Toleration Acts (New York: Scribner's, 1889)

Mendes-Flohr/Reinharz, = Paul Mendes-Flohr & Jehuda Reinharz, The Jew in the Modern World 2nd ed., (New York, 1995)

Hunt = Lynn Hunt, The French Revolution and Human Rights: A Brief Documentary History (Boston: Bedford, 1996)

Parry = Clive Parry ed., Consolidated Treaty Series vol. 1 1969]