

History 600, seminar 3  
Fall, 2014  
M 1:20-3:20  
5255 Humanities  
Office hours: M 3:30-4:30, W 11-12, and by  
appointment  
Class email: [history600-3-f14@lists.wisc.edu](mailto:history600-3-f14@lists.wisc.edu)

Charles L. Cohen  
4115 Humanities  
263-1956 (office), -1800  
(Dept.) Mailbox: Humanities  
#4025 [clcohen@wisc.edu](mailto:clcohen@wisc.edu)  
<http://history.wisc.edu/cohen>

## THE AMERICAN REVOLUTIONARY SETTLEMENT OF RELIGION

The Constitution separates church and state—right? The United States was founded on Christian principles—wasn't it? How religion infiltrates modern American society derives from political and cultural configurations laid down in the colonial and Revolutionary periods, and how modern Americans construe (or misconstrue) those arrangements often depends on how they understand (or misunderstand) the American Revolutionary Settlement of Religion. This course will examine the particulars of that Settlement and suggest how it has shaped dynamics we experience today. It also provides the opportunity for students to conduct their own research into any aspect of the Settlement.

The following readings are required and are available at the University Bookstore:

John Fea, *Was America Founded as a Christian Nation?*  
Frank Lambert, *The Founding Fathers and the Place of Religion in America*  
Matthew L. Harris & Thomas S. Kidd, eds., *The Founding Fathers and the Debate Over Religion  
in Revolutionary America*

These items are also available as physical reserves in the College Library. In addition, you will find the following reference on reserve:

Jules Benjamin, *A Student's Guide to History*, 9<sup>th</sup> ed.

Additional readings are available in E-Reserves at the College Library. You can find E-Reserves in your MyUW account. For information, see <http://www.library.wisc.edu/college/services-at-college/reserves/>.

### Course Webpage on Learn@UW

The syllabus and other materials are available at Learn@UW (<https://learnuw.wisc.edu/>). You will need your NetID and password to enter. Please check the site routinely for materials and news.

### Assignments

In writing any assignment, you should draw on the class discussions, readings, and appropriate outside knowledge, making specific statements firmly rooted in the evidence, using quotations whenever applicable, and evaluating the arguments of all “authorities” (including me). Papers must be typed and double-spaced; they are due in class on the day noted except if otherwise indicated. Information about specific assignments is located on pp. 4-5, *infra*.

Reading and discussion assignments: You are expected to have read all of the assigned material by the class meeting on which it is due.

Writing assignments: One-page assignments should run 250-300 words (they may run just over one page, but please try to adhere to the word limit). The two-page assignment should run 500-600 words.

Research assignments: These are designed to help you get your research project moving.

Lengths vary. Minor assignments: A 50-word limit means “no longer than 50 words.” You may use fewer. Theses are designed to teach research as well as writing skills.

Final research paper: The course's centerpiece is an original research paper—minimum 15 pages—on any

topic related to the American Revolutionary Settlement of Religion. You are required to use a range of primary sources and to become well acquainted with the secondary literature on your chose topic. We will be discussing the research paper throughout the semester.

**NB:** To compensate for the fact that, because of Labor Day, the course begins in the second week of the term, there are reading and minor assignments due on Sept. 8.

**Library Workshop:** All students are required to attend the workshop, "Introduction to Historical Research," conducted by Lisa Saywell in Memorial Library (Room 231). The workshops are offered in 231 Memorial Library. Please register for one of the sessions, using the following links: Tuesday, Sept. 16: <http://go.wisc.edu/i66t09>; Thursday, Sept. 18: <http://go.wisc.edu/hr2w29>; Wednesday, Sept. 24: <http://go.wisc.edu/d5x49h>. For more information, see: <http://researchguides.library.wisc.edu/introhist>.

### **Paper Presentation and Writing Aids**

Papers should follow the guidelines for presentation set out in the Style Sheet on both my webpage ([http://faculty.history.wisc.edu/cohen/style\\_sheet.pdf](http://faculty.history.wisc.edu/cohen/style_sheet.pdf)) and the Course Materials section of the course page in Learn@UW. The Writing Aids section of my webpage provides examples of A papers and exemplary fifty-word sentences (<http://history.wisc.edu/cohen/writing.html>).

As noted above, I have placed a copy of Jules Benjamin, *A Student's Guide to History*, on reserve. The Library has the 9<sup>th</sup> edition, although the 12<sup>th</sup> is the most current. No matter. You may use any edition or another guide to writing history as a reference on how to construct arguments, format papers, develop a bibliography, etc. And, of course, you may speak with me.

### **Grading**

Work will be assessed using an A-F scale, which will convert to a 4-point scale for purposes of calculating the final grade. Individual assignments may include + or – designations, but the final grades will be entered according to the UW-Madison system (A, AB, B, etc.)

The assignments will be weighted as follows:

Final research paper: 40%

Each one-page paper: 5% (four papers total 20%)

Two-page paper: 10%

Class participation throughout the semester: 20% You are expected to attend and participate in all class meetings. Class participation will be evaluated on a combination of attendance and quality of discussion (which is not identical to quantity).

Participation in class presentations of drafts: 5% for own paper, 5% as commentator (10% total)

Neither the minor assignments nor the research assignments will be graded, but failure to turn them in will lower your class participation grade.

### **Disability Statement**

This course is set up to include persons with disabilities. Please let me know if you need accommodations in the curriculum, instruction, or assessments to enable your full participation. I will attempt to maintain confidentiality of the information you share with me.

### **Academic Conduct Statement**

I expect you to conform to the highest standards of academic integrity and conduct; for the University's policy on such matters, see <http://students.wisc.edu/doso/acadintegrity.html>. For help in understanding what constitutes plagiarism and how to avoid it, see the Writing Center's site, <http://writing.wisc.edu/Handbook/QuotingSources.html>. If you have any questions at all about what constitutes proper conduct, I would be happy to speak with you.

Date	Assignments
Sept. 8	<p>Overview</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Lambert, <i>Founding Fathers and the Place of Religion</i>  <b>Minor Assignment #1</b>  <b>Schedule Attendance at “Introduction to Historical Research”</b></p>
15	<p>Religion and the American Revolution</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Fea, ... <i>Christian Nation?</i>, 77-133; Harris and Kidd, ... <i>Debate Over Religion</i>, 24-38  <b>Minor Assignment #2</b>  <b>Research Assignment #1</b></p>
22	<p>Religion in the First State Constitutions (<i>NB: This session will meet in the Wisconsin Historical Society, room 318.</i>)</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Fea, <i>Was America Founded...?</i>, 134-46; Harris and Kidd, ... <i>Debate Over Religion</i>, 50-77; Edwin Gaustad, <i>Neither King nor Prelate</i>, 159-74; Nicholas Wolterstorff, “A Religious Argument for the Civil Right to Freedom of Religious Exercise, Drawn from American History”  <b>Writing Assignment #1</b>  <b>Research Assignment #2</b>  <b>Guest: Richard Pifer</b>, Director of Reference and Public Services, WHS</p>
29	<p>The Constitution and the First Amendment</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Fea, ... <i>Christian Nation?</i>, 147-68; Gaustad, <i>Neither King nor Prelate</i>, 151-56; Harris and Kidd, ... <i>Debate Over Religion</i>, 78-113  <b>Writing Assignment #2</b></p>
Oct. 6	<p>Separation of Church and State</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Harris and Kidd, ... <i>Debate Over Religion</i>, 114-56; Philip Hamburger, <i>Separation of Church and State</i>, 144-89  <b>Minor Assignment #3</b>  <b>Research Assignment #3</b></p>
13	<p>The Founders’ Personal Beliefs</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Fea, ... <i>Christian Nation?</i>, 169-243; Harris and Kidd, <i>Debate Over Religion</i>, 157-85  <b>Writing Assignment #3</b>  <b>In-class exercise:</b> Divide into groups to discuss the question, “How were the founders’ personal religious beliefs reflected in the American Revolutionary Settlement of Religion through ca. 1800?”</p>
20	<p>Concepts of Religious Freedom</p> <p><b>Reading:</b> Chris Beneke, <i>Beyond Toleration</i>, 157-201; David Sehat, <i>The Myth of American Religious Freedom</i>, 13-69  <b>Minor Assignment #4</b>  <b>Research Assignment #4</b></p>
27	<p>Nineteenth-Century Dynamics</p>

**Reading:** Fea, ... *Christian Nation?*, 3-42; Dickson Bruce, *Earnestly Contending*, 120-39; Abraham Lincoln, "Second Inaugural Address"; *Reynolds v. U.S.* [98 U.S. 145]

**Writing Assignment #4**

Nov. 3 A Contemporary Echo

**Reading:** Fea, ... *Christian Nation?*, 43-76, 244-46; Sarah Barringer Gordon, *The Spirit of the Law*, 1-14, 209-16; "The Religious Freedom Restoration Act of 1993"; "*Burwell v. Hobby Lobby Stores*" [573/2 U.S., 13-354]

**Research Assignment #5**

10 [No Class – work on your research paper. I will be available for consultation.]

**Research Assignment #6**

17 Working on the Research Paper

**Research Assignment #7**

24 Class Presentations

**Class Presentation Assignment**

Dec. 1 Class Presentations

**Class Presentation Assignment**

8 Concluding Discussion: How to bring historical perspectives to bear on the present

**Writing Assignment #5**

15 **Research Paper Due**

**Specific Assignments**

**Sept. 8:**

Minor Assignment #1: Summarizing an Argument. In one sentence NOT EXCEEDING 50 words (the 51<sup>st</sup> word and its successors face a terrible fate that you do not wish to tempt), summarize Lambert's argument about the two foundings.

**Sept. 15:**

Minor Assignment #2: Developing a research question: In one sentence NOT EXCEEDING 50 words (see above for implied but real threat), pose a potential research question suggested by the documents in the Harris and Kidd anthology. [NB: This exercise is just for practice; the question you develop need not be the question that you intend to research for the final paper.]

Research Assignment #1: Brieffield report. Examine any single hard-copy (NOT digital, although microfilm and fiche are ok) eighteenth-century primary source located in a UW-Madison library and submit a brief report that contains the following information: what the document is, when it was created, who authored it, who constituted the intended audience, and what it contains.

**Sept. 22:**

Writing Assignment #1: Write a one-page paper analyzing the relationships between religious freedom and citizenship that the earliest state constitutions set out.

Research Assignment #2: In a sentence or two (there is no specified word limit), pose a question that you intend to answer in your research paper.

**Sept. 29:**

Writing Assignment #2: Write a one-page paper analyzing the most salient difference between the religious settlement created by the state constitutions and that created by the original Federal Constitution (including the First Amendment).

**Oct. 6:**

Minor Assignment #3: *Evaluating a scholar's use of evidence:* In one sentence NOT EXCEEDING 50 words (you should know how to be brief by now), evaluate Hamburger's use of Jefferson's letter to the Danbury Baptists.

Research Assignment #3: Submit a revised research question.

**Oct. 13**

Writing Assignment #3: Using especially the Declaration of Independence as well as other documents in the Harris and Kidd anthology authored by Jefferson, write a one-page paper setting out Jefferson's definition of "religion" and hypothesizing the possible significance that this understanding might have had on subsequent generations of Americans.

**Oct. 20**

Minor Assignment #4: *Assessing contrasting interpretations:* In one sentence NOT EXCEEDING 50 words (or else...), compare Beneke's and Sehat's interpretations of the extent to which Americans by the early nineteenth century enjoyed religious freedom.

Research Assignment #4: Submit a draft research proposal (no more than two pages). The proposal should include the following elements: an explanation of the topic and the issue(s) to be addressed, a survey of the scholarly literature on the subject, a hypothesis or preliminary argument, an explanation of the research strategy and methodology, and a statement of the essay's significance for understanding the topic.

**Oct. 27**

Writing Assignment #4: Write a one-page paper that explains and critiques how the decision in *U.S. v. Reynolds* references Revolutionary-era documents (like Madison's "Memorial and Remonstrance") about the Religious Settlement.

**Nov. 3**

Research Assignment #5: Submit a revised research proposal (3-page maximum).

**Nov. 10**

Research Assignment #6: Submit a draft bibliography of at least 10 items in proper bibliographic style. (The assignment may be submitted electronically.)

**Nov. 17**

Research Assignment #7: Submit electronically a rough draft of the final research paper, which must run at least 10 pages. The draft should have as complete a scholarly apparatus (notes, bibliography) as possible.

**Nov. 24 and Dec. 1**

Class Presentation Assignments: Each student will give a 10-minute presentation on his/her research, discussing the issues involved, the findings, and questions remaining. Each student will also act as a commentator for another student, critiquing the rough draft and suggesting revisions.

**Dec. 8**

Writing Assignment #5: *Becoming a public intellectual* - Find any contemporary (within the past 3 months) item about religion in modern America and write a 500/600-word (2-page) blog commentary that includes a historical perspective. Submit the commentary to the class website.

**Dec. 15: Noon**

FINAL RESEARCH PAPER due in my mailbox, #4025 (fourth floor, Mosse Humanities Building).

# A PROCLAMATION

## *Regarding Late Papers*

Whereas it may come to pass that one or more individuals, whether through dilatoriness, dereliction, irresponsibility, or chutzpah, may seek respite and surcease from escorial demands through procrastination, delay, and downright evasion;

And whereas this unhappy happenstance contributes mightily to malfeasance on the part of parties of the second part (i.e., students, the instructed, you) and irascibility on the part of us (i.e., me);

Be it therefore known, understood, apprehended, and comprehended:

That all assignments must reach us on or by the exact hour announced in class, and that failure to comply with this wholesome and most generous regulation shall result in the assignment forfeiting one half of a letter grade each day for which it is tardy (i.e., an "A" shall become an "AB"), "one day" being defined as a 24-hour period commencing at the announced hour on which the assignment is due; and that the aforementioned reduction in grade shall continue for each succeeding day of delay until either the assignment shall be remitted or its value shrunk unto nothingness. And let all acknowledge that the responsibility for our receiving papers deposited *surreptitio* (i.e., in my mailbox or under my door), whether timely or belated, resides with the aforementioned second-part parties (i.e., you again), hence onus for the miscarriage of such items falls upon the writer's head (i.e., until I clutch your scribbles to my breasts, I must assume you have not turned them in, all protestations to the contrary notwithstanding).

Be it nevertheless affirmed:

That the greater part of justice residing in mercy, it may behoove us, acting entirely through our gracious prerogative, to award an extension in meritorious cases, such sufferance being granted only upon consultation with us, in which case a negotiated due date shall be proclaimed; it being perfectly well understood that failure to observe this new deadline shall result in the immediate and irreversible failure of the assignment (i.e., an "F"), its value being accounted as a null set and less than that of a vile mote. And be it further noted that routine disruptions to routine (i.e., lack of sleep occasioned by pink badgers dancing on the ceiling) do not conduce to mercy, but that severe dislocations brought on by Acts of God (exceedingly traumatic events to the body and/or soul, such as having the earth swallow one up on the way to delivering the assignment) perpetrated upon either oneself or one's loving kindred, do.

And we wish to trumpet forth:

That our purpose in declaiming said proclamation, is not foremost to terminate the wanton flouting of our didactic intentions but to encourage our beloved students to consult with us, and apprehend us of their difficulties aforehand (i.e., talk to me, baby), so that the cruel axe of the executioner fall not upon their Grade Point Average and smite it with a vengeance.

To which proclamation, we do affix our seal:

